

Commentary on Andrzej Kisielewicz's
*A new approach to argumentation and reasoning
based on mathematical practice*

Andrew Aberdein

School of Arts and Communication,
Florida Institute of Technology

1st European Conference on Argumentation (ECA 2015),
Universidade Nova de Lisboa, 10 June 2015

Where We (Dis)agree

Where we agree

Conventional Wisdom:

1. Mathematical reasoning \neq everyday reasoning

Where We (Dis)agree

Where we agree

Conventional Wisdom:

1. Mathematical reasoning \neq everyday reasoning
2. Formal logic adequately models mathematical reasoning

Where We (Dis)agree

Where we agree

Conventional Wisdom:

1. ~~Mathematical reasoning \neq everyday reasoning~~
2. ~~Formal logic adequately models mathematical reasoning~~

Where We (Dis)agree

Where we agree

Conventional Wisdom:

1. ~~Mathematical reasoning \neq everyday reasoning~~
2. ~~Formal logic adequately models mathematical reasoning~~

Where we disagree

Aberdein Since mathematical reasoning \approx everyday reasoning, techniques that work for **everyday** reasoning should work for **mathematical** reasoning.

Where We (Dis)agree

Where we agree

Conventional Wisdom:

1. ~~Mathematical reasoning \neq everyday reasoning~~
2. ~~Formal logic adequately models mathematical reasoning~~

Where we disagree

Aberdein Since mathematical reasoning \approx everyday reasoning, techniques that work for **everyday** reasoning should work for **mathematical** reasoning.

Kisielewicz Since mathematical reasoning \approx everyday reasoning, techniques that work for **mathematical** reasoning should work for **everyday** reasoning.

A Fundamental Educational Mistake

'treating **formal rules of inference** as a base for **real life reasoning** is a great scientific misconception . . . We face a kind of an epistemic failure. Teaching logic in a way it is done now is a **fundamental educational mistake**.'

Logic is Considering Possibilities

'The main general thesis of this article is that the essence of logical reasoning lies in the **analysis of possibilities**. *Logic is considering possibilities*. We accept a conclusion as *logical* if we are convinced that there is **no other (reasonable) possibility**.'

Logic is Considering Possibilities

'The main general thesis of this article is that the essence of logical reasoning lies in the **analysis of possibilities**. *Logic is considering possibilities*. We accept a conclusion as *logical* if we are convinced that there is **no other (reasonable) possibility**.'

'It is the **ability to differentiate** between **reasonable, meaningful** options and **unworthy** ones that is the key to our reasoning's effectiveness.'

Commentary on Andrzej Kisielewicz's
*A new approach to argumentation and reasoning
based on mathematical practice*

Andrew Aberdein

School of Arts and Communication,
Florida Institute of Technology

1st European Conference on Argumentation (ECA 2015),
Universidade Nova de Lisboa, 10 June 2015